
Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Robin T Cox - 2007/09/24 15:30

Is 'Flower of Scotland' a national disgrace, as alleged in today's Herald?

<http://www.theherald.co.uk/sport/headlines/display.var.1708988.0.0.php>

If so, which national anthem would more accurately reflect modern Scottish culture and society?

I must confess that I'm stuck for an answer, and 'Scotland the Brave' reminds me too much of the singing shortbread tin.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by dws - 2007/09/24 18:05

Robin T Cox wrote:

Is 'Flower of Scotland' a national disgrace, as alleged in today's Herald?

If so, which national anthem would more accurately reflect modern Scottish culture and society?

I must confess that I'm stuck for an answer, and 'Scotland the Brave' reminds me too much of the singing shortbread tin.

I wouldn't go as far as call it a disgrace, the original by the Corries was a decent enough song but hardly an anthem - it was never written as such. It isn't helped by the fact that the bagpipes can't play the "Tae think again" line because of their scale limitations, or the brass band "Oom-pah-pah" arrangement that seems to be sadly prevalent when it's played at sporting occasions.

I agree with your point about Scotland the Brave, it conjures up images of Andy Stewart and the Bruce McClure dancers.

I like "Highland Cathedral" and I've heard tell someone's written lyrics for it - but I've never heard them so I can't comment.

The trouble is you'll never please everyone, so it's a right poisoned chalice for someone to take on.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by TLJ - 2007/09/24 18:47

dws wrote:

I like "Highland Cathedral" and I've heard tell someone's written lyrics for it - but I've never heard them so I can't comment.

Take your pick from what may be the "official" version:

Land of our fathers, we will always be
Faithful and loyal to our own country.
In times of danger, we will set you free.
Lead you to glory and to victory.

Hail, Caledonia, to our ancient prayer.
In this Highland Cathedral, let our standards, bear.
Joining, together, with one dream to share.
God bless the people of this land so fair.

CHORUS

Gone is the past, let us start anew.
Let this hope of peace, always remain.
Spirit of Scotia, be strong and true.
Then your children will smile again, again, again, again.

Rise, Caledonia, let your voices ring
In this Highland Cathedral of our God and King.
Whom, joy and liberty, to all, will bring.
Come; let your heart, with love and courage, sing.

CHORUS

Lonely the exile, o'er distant seas,
The home of their birth, gone from their eyes.
Bring back their souls o'er the ocean breeze
To the land where their fathers lie.

REPEAT LAST VERSE.

Ben Kelly

or this one

There is a land far from this distant shore
Where heather grows and Highland Eagles soar
There is a land that will live ever more
Deep in my heart, my Bonnie Scotland Highland Cathedral - the song

Though I serve so far away
I still see your streams, cities and dreams
I can't wait until the day
When I'll come home once more Highland Cathedral - the song

So Lord keep me from the harm of war
Through all the dangers and the battles roar
Keep me safe until I'm home once more
Home to my own in Bonnie Scotland

Terry Mechan, 1998

Apparently there's another version by Donald Smith but I haven't traced the words.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Bananaman - 2007/09/24 18:50

I agree with dws I like Flower of Scotland but I don't think its a great anthem.

Scotland the Brave is a bit too jingoistic but is more uplifting.

My choice? Mmmmm?

"I will go", perhaps or The Braes of Killiekrankie, or Mhairi's Wedding.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by dws - 2007/09/24 19:05

Thanks for the lyrics TLJ - I think the first set would suit admirably. B)

Now all we have to do is teach them to everyone in Scotland and get them to agree to Highland cathedral as a national anthem.:) :lol:

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by TLJ - 2007/09/24 19:10

dws wrote:

Thanks for the lyrics TLJ - I think the first set would suit admirably. B)

Now all we have to do is teach them to everyone in Scotland and get them to agree to Highland cathedral as a national anthem.:) :lol:

I've sung these words at a funeral earlier this year. They're very difficult to fit and some notes are a wee bit on the high side too, so I'm not so sure about it being an anthem.

Of course, a few countries (eg Spain) don't have words to their anthem, they just have music. Perhaps we could to the same as it's a great tune.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Martin - 2007/09/25 09:13

From the point of view of the words, I like "A Man's a Man" and it would probably get my vote, but before anyone bites my head off saying it can be dirgey, that would also be my reservation.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by DoricMan - 2007/09/25 13:04

Martin wrote:

From the point of view of the words, I like "A Man's a Man" and it would probably get my vote, but before anyone bites my head off saying it can be dirgey, that would also be my reservation. I like your suggestion for "A Man's a Man" Martin, and perhaps its undelying statement of inclusiveness, of all our peoples, here in Scotland.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Bananaman - 2007/09/25 13:16

I think most Scottish tunes can be "a bit dirgey".

I think there's a slightly melancholic (possibly gloomy) side to our character which comes out in our music.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Levenax - 2007/09/25 14:36

Whilst one might agree with the sentiments of "A Man's a Man" my feminist wife takes great exception to the words and it's difficult to disagree with her. It's also a bit of a dirge as was amply demonstrated by the grisly rendition inflicted on us at the opening of the Parliament.

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by The Laird - 2007/09/25 15:25

I don` t know what all the fuss is about.We already have an excellent anthem.its called "THE Queen" :evil: :evil::lol: :lol:

Second yellow card TLJ?????

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Bruce - 2007/09/25 16:16

The Laird, are you suggesting we should choose a new anthem from Queen? How about "I Want To Break Free"? ;)

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by dws - 2007/09/25 16:46

The Laird wrote:

I don` t know what all the fuss is about.We already have an excellent anthem.its called "THE Queen" :evil: :evil::lol: :lol:

Second yellow card TLJ?????

Altogether:

AND WITH A MIGHTY RUSH, REBELLIOUS SCOTS TO CRUSH.....

Aye, that` ll catch on.....:dry: :lol: :lol:

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by TLJ - 2007/09/25 17:02

The Laird wrote:

Second yellow card TLJ?????

For the avoidance of doubt, I didn't even know you'd got a first one !

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by The Laird - 2007/09/25 17:17

:laugh: :laugh: :laugh:

http://www.scotsgait.co.uk/component/option,com_fireboard/Itemid,93/func,view/id,56/catid,17/

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by TLJ - 2007/09/25 17:48

The Laird wrote:

:laugh: :laugh: :laugh:

:laugh: :laugh: :laugh:

I obviously bear no long term grudges !

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Martin - 2007/09/26 08:03

Here's an idea; run a national competition to commission a new tune for "A Man's a Man". Then we get the words and a new, truly inspiring tune. No cash prize involved, just the credit and the honour of having your work as the national anthem.

Then term "man" refers to mankind which encompasses the male and female gender. Any other interpretation is feminist, PC claptrap the like of which which is stifling this country.

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Levenax - 2007/09/26 14:33

Martin wrote:Then term "man" refers to mankind which encompasses the male and female gender. Any other interpretation is feminist, PC claptrap the like of which which is stifling this country.

I'm no slave to political correctness as some of you may have noticed but I do have some sympathy with those of a female persuasion when they complain about men and mankind as generic terms for humans and humankind.

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by louise - 2007/09/26 21:30

I like flower of Scotland but if people dont what about this minus the kissing the fellas we could have friends instead of fellas? I always think of scotland when i hear this song.

UpperCut » Artists D » Dolores Keane » Caledonia

i dont know if you can see
the changes that have come over me
and these past few days i've been afraid
that i might drift away
i've been telling old stories, singing songs
that make me think about where i come from
and thats the reason why i seem
so far away today

let me tell you that i love you
that i think about you all the time
caledonia you're calling me
now i'm going home
and if i shall become a stranger
no it would make me more than sad
caledonia's been everything i've ever had

well i have moved
and i've kept on moving
proved the points
that i needed proving
i've lost the friends

that i needed losing
found others on the way
i have kissed the fellas
and left them sighing
stolen dreams yes theres no denying
i've travelled hard
sometimes with conscience flying
somewhere with the wind

let me tell you that i love you
that i think about you all the time
caledonia you;re calling me
now i'm going home
and if i shall become a stranger
no it would make me more than sad
caledonia's been everything i've ever had

now i'm sitting here
before the fire
the empty room
a forest choir
the flames have cooled
dont get any higher
they've withered now
they're gone
and i'm steady thinking
my way is clear
and i know what
i will do tomorrow
the hands have shaken
the kisses flowed
and i will dissappear

let me tell you that i love you
that i think about you all the time
caledonia you;re calling me
now i'm going home
and if i shall become a stranger
no it would make me more than sad
caledonia's been everything i've ever had

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by TLJ - 2007/09/26 21:33

louise wrote:

I like flower of Scotland but if people dont what about this minus the kissing the fellas we could have friends instead of fellas? I always think of scotland when i hear this song.

You can hear Caledonia on Ceol here

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by louise - 2007/09/26 21:51

What about this. This makes me think of scotland as well.

The Wild Mountain Thyme

Here is a love song about love among the heather - and the sweetly perfumed, wild mountain thyme.

You can also access an MP3 Format version (720Kb) of this song.

The Wild Mountain Thyme
O the summer time has come
And the trees are sweetly blooming
And wild mountain thyme
Grows around the purple heather.
Will you go, lassie, go?

Chorus
And we'll all go together,
To pull wild mountain thyme,
All around the purple heather.
Will you go, lassie, go?

I will build my love a tower,
By yon clear crystal fountain,
And on it I will pile,
All the flowers of the mountain.
Will you go, lassie, go?

Chorus

I will range through the wilds
And the deep land so dreary
And return with the spoils
To the bower o' my dearie.
Will ye go lassie go ?

Chorus

If my true love she'll not come,
Then I'll surely find another,
To pull wild mountain thyme,
All around the purple heather.
Will you go, lassie, go?

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by louise - 2007/09/26 22:03

I do really like flower of scotland but and if i had to choose a national anthem it would probably be that because i know the words. I have to say but that has anyone noticed that there is an awful lot of discussion on the internet and in the media about scotland since the SNP won the election. Its like all these scottish issues are suddenly really big news but only in scotland. You dont see these issues on the uk media its only newspapers and TV in scotland. I really feel I am being hit everyday with some negative story about scotland. I love this song. I always have since i was a wee kid. As soon as you get to the part about "when will we see your likes again" it just makes you think that you know what we are seeing it right now. All these people who beleive in scotland and that we are rising to become a nation again. Every single day. whenever i used to get to that line i used to feel sad because i used to think when will we see the rise of scotland again. I dont anymore i feel hopeful.

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Niall Ban - 2007/09/27 09:47

Scots Wha Hae sung by the Glasgow Phoenix Choir is my only choice. I do have a Gaidhlig choice but as most people cannot speak or understand God's own language I will not nominate it here.

'S mis le meas
Niall Ban.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by TLJ - 2007/09/27 18:13

Niall Ban wrote:

Scots Wha Hae sung by the Glasgow Phoenix Choir is my only choice. I do have a Gaidhlig choice but as most people cannot speak or understand God's own language I will not nominate it here.

'S mis le meas
Niall Ban.

You might not want to nominate it - but could you tell us what one it is ?

Tapaidh leat

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Robin T Cox - 2007/10/12 17:18

Thanks everyone for some great suggestions.

Finally, I think I'm going to reply to this thread by suggesting that, although 'Flower of Scotland' is a fine anthem, it's too narrowly nationalistic.

So instead I suggest the old Harry Lauder favourite: 'Keep Right On to the End of the Road'.

<http://www.sirharrylauder.com/lyrics/endroad.html>

It has a great marching tune.

Everybody knows the words and can join in the chorus, and it's great for sporting occasions, and reminds me of the famous Liverpool anthem 'You'll Never Walk Alone', so it would be good for inspiring our team.

It would make a fine national anthem.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by schawaldowris - 2007/10/12 19:37

The problem we have in Scotland is not the lack of suitable anthems but a surfeit.

There is a lot of popular, traditional and classic music to choose from and everyone has there own favourites.

My own choice at the moment would be "Freedom come all ye" by Hamish Henderson. Or possibly "Scot Wha Hae" and what about "A person's a person for a that", then again there's Highland Cathedral. Oh.. and Hail Caledonia.

Och.. I might change my mind tomorrow!

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

schawaldowris wrote:

The problem we have in Scotland is not the lack of suitable anthems but a surfeit.

There is a lot of popular, traditional and classic music to choose from and everyone has their own favourites.

My own choice at the moment would be "Freedom come all ye" by Hamish Henderson.

Another which definitely fits with Scottish sentiments but it's a difficult one to sing along to:

Roch the wind in the clear days dawin
Blows the clouds heelstre-gowdie ow'r the bay
But there's mair nor a roch wind blawin
Through the great glen o' the world the day.
It's a thocht that will gar oor rottans
A' they rogues that gang gallus, fresh and gay
Tak the road, and seek ither loanins
For their ill ploys, tae sport and play.

Nae mair will the bonnie callants
Mairch tae war when oor braggarts crouselly craw
Nor wee weans frae pit-heid and clachan
Mourn the ships sailing doon the Broomielaw,
Broken faimlies in lands we've herriet
Will curse Scotland the Brave nae mair, nae mair;
Back and white, ane ti ither mairriet,
Mak the vile barracks o' thier maisters bare.

O come all ye at hame wi' Freedom,
Never heid whit the hoodies croak for doom.
In your hoose a' the bairnes o' Adam
Can find breid, barley-bree and painted room.
When Maclean meets wi's friens in Springburn,
A' the roses and geens will turn tae bloom,
And a black boy frae yont Nyanga
Dings the fell gallows o' the burghers doon.

Listen here after about 1 min 50secs

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by dws - 2008/01/04 21:56

I wouldn't suggest this song as an anthem, but I agree with its sentiment.

{youtube}v=MoTaibLvkC8{/youtube}

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by maragdubh - 2008/01/05 00:55

This is my first effort at posting being the new boy (so to speak) I have heard quite a few refer to my heritage as shortbread tin culture ie. tartan and bagpipes andy stewart and all that. Im afraid I can't see anything wrong with it. A culture is a conglomerate of tangible and intangibles language, poetry, system of worship, humour, laws, music, traditions and so on. Bagpipes is the most nationally identifiable musical instrument on the planet and is played at the highest standard all over the world and tartan the choice of dress of the elite. What's like us. I think those who would treat our heritage with contempt are best ignored for they have been americanized.
thank you.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by maragdubh - 2008/01/05 12:29

Feminists sadly have created a box for themselves and ticked it. by declaring to be feminists they have put on blinkers and narrowed their views. what a pity the modern woman has aspired to equality with men when they were once so superior As for "a mans a man" most sensible people know it means mankind which of course includes women, we once upon a time all knew that. If the words are heard and understood, it is a very inspiring song and most of all it is Scottish. Be proud.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Riotgrll - 2008/01/09 12:20

I want a national anthem which:

- 1 - Doesn't mention 'Mountains', 'lochs', or any other kind of rural beauty.
- 2 - isn't in archaic Scots that nobody really understands ("Scots Wha Hae' . . .who actually speaks like that?)

This rules out the Highland Cathedral lyrics, and also that other favourite, the Freedom Come-all-ye, which is virtually incomprehensible.

I would have suggested Big Country's 'In A Big Country' as a suitable anthem, but it fails test one because of all the lover's voice down a mountainside stuff.

Malcolm Middleton's 'We're all going to Die' would make a suitable non-nationalistic, fatalistic national anthem, plus you could dance to it.

We are an ironic, wry, self-deprecating nation. Let's have those qualities reflected in our anthem, and none of this 'beautiful hills aye wha hae' nonsense.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by Riotgrll - 2008/01/09 12:21

P.s.

You don't have to be a 'feminist' to find 'a man's a man' exclusive. you just have to be female.

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by BoB - 2008/01/10 00:31

Nothing wrong with Flower o'Scotland.:)

:unsure:

Better than Scotland the Brave or some of the others they suggested!:dry:

I have got used to hearing Highland Cathedral, but I have already got fed up of hearing it. :P

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by dws - 2008/04/14 20:34

Bob,

Judging by yer icon, ye need tae eat more!!:lol:

=====

Re:Flower of Scotland - a national disgrace?

Posted by robbiedoo58 - 2008/04/14 21:34

d.....I worked in China 2001-2004 as an ESL teacher. On the first week of each month, I would teach my (teenage) students a song.

Of the songs that I taught them, the one they loved most was 'Flower of Scotland'. They loved the tune, the words, and the history behind it.

'Flower of Scotland' was the ONLY item that the students ever asked me about outside classroom hours.... 'nuff said.....cheer:

=====