

---

## Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/03 17:29

---

I just logged on to the BBC website for readers comments on todays news about the Scottish Government pushing ahead with Local Income Tax.

<http://newsforums.bbc.co.uk/nol/thread.jspsortBy=1&forumID=5296&start=15&tstart=0&edition=1&ttl=20080903180320#paginator>

The idea that Scotland is subsidised really is gaining a lot of momentum down south.

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/03 17:30

---

<http://i37.tinypic.com/28r2hjq.jpg>

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/03 17:31

---

<http://i33.tinypic.com/ngf588.jpg>

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/03 17:32

---

<http://i37.tinypic.com/311w8qu.jpg>

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Robin T Cox - 2008/09/03 17:53

---

Spamming is verboten.

Either back up your claims with links or evidence, or piss off (to use a Scottish phrase, with which you may be familiar).

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by rickyross3359 - 2008/09/03 17:55

---

Oh well just wonder by the way how many of Scots decent there are in Greater London. I know there many many organisation for them in the city? Wonder how much London really costs us? :huh:

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Robin T Cox - 2008/09/03 17:59

---

Why does any of that bother you?

Please explain.

=====

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/03 18:09

---

"Either back up your claims with links or evidence, or piss off (to use a Scottish phrase, with which you may be familiar)."

I did provide a link. And I'm not spamming. No need to be so aggressive. I'm just posting to start debate. Take it easy.

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/03 18:25

---

Good post from another website message board:

"One one item I agree with here we should start to get more serious about our impending independence and figure out all the options before us particularly the fiscal ones. This after all is one of the driving forces for independence that we can choose how best to run our country for the benefits of Scots first and foremost. To do this however ALL of the books need to be open so we can openly and freely know what our various options are. Like any other country on the planet hard compromises will need to be made, trade offs will need to happen - Scots above all else are realists and we are not expecting a land of milk and honey (despite Unionists tellings us that is our dream), rather we just want to determine how to run our country for the best benefit of our own people. Also like any other country Scotland will determine a unique set of compromises which reflect our own aspirations and beliefs, rather than those of a wannabe world power. Looking at any one item in isolation even the prospect of an Oil Fund is fatally flawed without knowing all of the various figures and choices before us. With Westminster we already know they cannot be trusted to be open and honest to even let Scots know what our options are e.g. . The McCrone report deliberately and maliciously withheld basic economic information from us so we could not even weigh up our basic options. see - [tinyurl.com/mcrone](http://tinyurl.com/mcrone) . UK Continental Shelf (Economic region). Callaghan went to extraordinary lengths to ensure that all the income from the North Sea headed directly south to the Treasury, ordering the designation of an entirely new economic region "the UK Continental Shelf (UKCS) see - [tinyurl.com/6k5dyd](http://tinyurl.com/6k5dyd) . In the 2005 Great Deception Niall Aslen exposed more fraudulent accounting which was trying to hide the truth from Scots. see - [tinyurl.com/biglies](http://tinyurl.com/biglies) With the latest GERS (2007) more lies have been exposed and many of Niall's corrections accepted. see - [tinyurl.com/GERS2007](http://tinyurl.com/GERS2007) So if the Unionists want to truly give us free choice here open up all the books and all of the options so we know what our choices are, but no this won't happen with democracy British style. Figures will continue to be hidden and manipulated so our challenge will be harder, but we are up to that challenge. We also have positive thoughts and energy to look at different ways that Scotland can do better to invest and grow both economically and socially rather than the Unionist tack of talking us down continually and telling us why we can't be any better and how we should be so grateful for what we have already, but again we don't even know what is true and what is not as our overlords are proven liars and manipulators. They have already stated they will do anything and everything to preserve their rotting Empire and we should assume they will be plotting against us until the bitter end. We need to take the initiative ourselves by any and all means to determine the choices before us. We must expose all of our fiscal choices e.g. . Our "investments" in the British Capital/South East Recent or planned investments are at least £168 billion - (see next post). So was our portion of these "investments", at least £13 billion, the best choice we could have made for Scots first and foremost ? . Our "investments" in the British world stage posturing. At least £200 billion - (see next post). So was our portion of these "investments", at least £17 billion the best choice we could have made for Scots first and foremost ? . Our "investments" in other areas of the British states mismanagement . Just a couple of examples are : . £31bn computer bill for new NHS system see [tinyurl.com/53cbmn](http://tinyurl.com/53cbmn) & [tinyurl.com/555kho](http://tinyurl.com/555kho) . Up to £110 billion wasted bailing out Northern Rock . BBC license fees "investment" when we can't even get our most popular sport free of charge and an independent report confirms massive "anglocentric" bias. see - [tinyurl.com/6md9t5](http://tinyurl.com/6md9t5) Yep let's openly have all Scots weigh up the options before us on how best to run our own country, but we need to know all facts and figures not just some conveniently skewed partial pieces of the overall puzzle. Saor Alba"

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by dws - 2008/09/03 19:40

---

This sort of mince has been peddled by Labour for years. "You're too poor to go it alone"... "you benefit financially from the Union": Should we be surprised that folk south of the border overheard them and believed it?

This has really bitten Labour in the arse. They have been disproved in saying that Scotland is subsidised, so they now look daft in their assertions. The furore created by the tabloids (and some broadsheets) of the English press has got into

---

full swing, so Labour wouldn't be popular in saying that Scotland is a net contributor to the treasury.

Ergo, whatever they say, they're bugged. I agree with Robin though, why such a big fuss? It isn't true, and those who would believe it would do so because they want to.

The same tabloids will squeal when independence is achieved and a true reflection of wealth becomes apparent...it sells papers, nothing more.

=====

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Bananaman - 2008/09/03 20:09

dws wrote:

Ergo, whatever they say, they're bugged. I agree with Robin though, why such a big fuss? It isn't true, and those who would believe it would do so because they want to.

The same tabloids will squeal when independence is achieved and a true reflection of wealth becomes apparent...it sells papers, nothing more.

True but this latest example in a long line of racist bigotry by our English cousins should not be allowed to pass without comment.

Its just another attempt by the English ruling elite to blame the state of their country on everyone else but themselves.

Mind you its one of the reasons I'm a fervent supporter of self-determination north of the border because for years we've blamed the English for our woes.

After independence it'll be interesting to see what bogey men (or women) come out of the closets to explain any shortfall between voter's expectations, politician's promises and the reality of our lives.

=====

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by LYDIA REID - 2008/09/03 21:15

The Matt O'Conner standing for London Mayor was the Matt O'Conner from Fathers for Justice.

He will know my name. I have spoken to him in his role in Fathers for Justice

I had a certain amount of respect for his views as Chair of that organisation. I read a great deal of his work. I thought him a reasonably intelligent man. Looking at the above posters my view has changed drastically. I will forward his views to his supporters in Scotland, I have a feeling his support will diminish somewhat here in Scotland.

A little work on the internet could have educated him no matter what the media told him. I would have thought any person thinking themselves fit to stand as London Mayor would have taken the trouble to ensure he got his facts right. However, when a person is desperate for publicity or fame it may be that integrity flies out of the window.

=====

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by LYDIA REID - 2008/09/03 21:20

I will ask the same question I ask when I hear this verbal diarrhea.

If we cost the rest of the U K so much why do they try so desperately to keep us when we so obviously want our independence?

=====

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

---

Posted by rickyross3359 - 2008/09/03 21:22

---

Well News at Ten tonight, has decided to report on Alex's Salmonds plans for the replacement of the council tax and that parking charges will now stop at most Scottish hospitals. The reporter did finish with the line "In these economic times will Scots want to pay an additional 3p in the pound". The English do tend to get wound up by changes that the Scottish government make and of course the press and media like to play to this. It suits them to do so.

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Clare - 2008/09/04 10:25

---

Hi Ricky. While I welcome any move to abolish the Council Tax set up I'm not convinced the proposals made by Swinney will work. I think they're very badly thought out.

Interesting to see Jamieson and the others clinging on to the whole absurd idea of making householders and owners pay for local services tho. When oh when are they going to realise that local services are not the sole responsibility of householders and recognise that we should all contribute to the pot?

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by dws - 2008/09/05 12:56

---

Let's put this one to bed once and for all, with many thanks to Brenna1508 for reminding me about the article::kiss: :)

Public figures back full debate on Scotland's place in the UK

Commentators south of the Border have cried foul in recent weeks over the apparently high levels of public spending in Scotland, claiming the country is being unfairly subsidised by taxpayers in the rest of the UK.

However, figures published by The Herald showed that public spending per head in Scotland was actually less than in Northern Ireland and London. The investigation also rebutted claims that Scots collect the most in benefits and have access to better public services, courtesy of taxpayers in the rest of the UK.

Q.E.D. Next!;)

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Kinghob - 2008/09/05 15:21

---

The clown that tried to get elected for london mayor at the expeance of slagging off Scotland as a subsidy junkie dive bombed.

His campaign was a joke.

England will eventually ignore the media and define her national identity and political voice by electing non unionist politicians, rather than what the 'indy' poster above seems to believe that England should define her own identity by being against Scotland.

Alex Salmond and his team, people like myself and LJ on here and a growing number of Scots do not need to hear anything about the fine country of England, it is 'britain' that is past her sell by date.

The English media is splitting up britain by default being clueless about the insular tone they use when they mention Scotland.

Again, for 'indy'-the most subsidised areas in these Isles per head are:

- 1) London
- 2) Northern ireland
- 3) Scotland

People in Scotland payed for canary Wharf, the most expensive building project in history per square inch, and we pay for the London Underground and we pay for some building called 'Portcullis House' etc.

Don't kid yourself about exactly who the subsidy junkies are within these Isles.....

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by LYDIA REID - 2008/09/05 16:40

Kinghob wrote:

The clown that tried to get elected for london mayor at the expeance of slagging off Scotland as a subsidy junkie dive bombed.

His campaign was a joke.

England will eventually ignore the media and define her national identity and political voice by electing non unionist politicians, rather than what the 'indy' poster above seems to believe that England should define her own identity by being against Scotland.

Alex Salmond and his team, people like myself and LJ on here and a growing number of Scots do not need to hear anything about the fine country of England, it is 'britain' that is past her sell by date.

The English media is splitting up britain by default being clueless about the insular tone they use when they mention Scotland.

Again, for 'indy'-the most subsidised areas in these Isles per head are:

- 1) London
- 2) Northern ireland
- 3) Scotland

People in Scotland payed for canary Wharf, the most expensive building project in history per square inch, and we pay for the London Underground and we pay for some building called 'Portcullis House' etc.

Don't kid yourself about exactly who the subsidy junkies are within these Isles.....

To prove that statement we need look no further than the fact that the Westminster Government have no intention of letting us go without a fight.

They are terrified of the figures which will prove they have fed the English public total rubbish for years.

They are also aware that the English public will be forced to support themselves with no subsidy flowing from north to south.

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Jimbo - 2008/09/05 18:53

Here are Niall Aslen's latest figures which put the lie to all this 'Scotland subsidised by England' pish.

The Great Obfuscation

---

<http://www.siol-nan-gaidheal.org/obfuscation.htm>

It would appear that the total cost of Trident (along with other things) has been charged to Scotland by the GERS compilers instead of just allocating us the proper figure 8.5% of the cost.

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/05 20:54

---

"England will eventually ignore the media and define her national identity and political voice by electing non unionist politicians, rather than what the 'indy' poster above seems to believe that England should define her own identity by being against Scotland".

Sorry - I'm new to this website. I just put those up for a bit of debate. I am for Scottish Independence. I believe in it strongly and have been working towards it for years. To suggest Scotland has ever been subsidised is deeply insulting and has been concocted chiefly by Scottish unionists to ensure they keep their noses in Westminster affairs. In my first post I was just pointing out that the English media, especially recently, is really riling up the English public. The public are believing it more and more strongly. I have family down there and they are always getting little digs and sponging etc;

Its not right that they should be fed these lies - however, will it help the Independence cause? Brown (although I agree his days are numbered) has already said today that Scotland will get more fiscal powers. And many commentators say that is to get Middle England off his back. Maybe them believing the lies will help?

Only problem is, in my opinion we need fiscal autonomy (including all resource income) or full Independence quickly. When the Tories get in I think the Scotland budget will be slashed and many journalists are saying the same thing. The Tories don't care about Scotland they just have to keep their voters happy.

=====

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/05 20:58

---

Some facts and figs taken from other sites:

"The GERS figures selectively define Scottish and British spending through a formula designed to impress upon Scots that they cannot survive without subsidy from England. It fiddles things like defining spending on Trident as a Scottish expenditure (cause the damned things are based there).

And there's the question of who benefits from spending, those English newspapers complaining about subsidising Scotland whose offices are in that monument to London pork barrels; The Docklands, with the extension of the Jubilee Line and Limehouse road, just like the Dome, the New Wembley, the Chunnel and fast rail link, New British Library, new airports and terminals, Tate Modern, The Globe Theatre, Royal Opera House, Olympics and with all the tax relief's awarded to such projects and their contractors in toe.

Then there's the spending on govt offices, quangos, research and test centers - half the government research and development budget is spent in one region of the UK: the South East while Scotland (8.9% of the population) receives just 4%. Scotland receives 4.8% of defence contracts while the South East get's 41% and with museums and galleries Scotland only receives 1.3% while London is awarded a massive 61.5%. Scotland holds 6.8% of top level civil service jobs while London get's 51%, the Foreign office spends no money whatsoever in Scotland yet is supposed to represent us all while the Scottish Parliament has no influence over it whatsoever. The money spent in England on the Channel Tunnel and rail link is part of the "national spending", but the money subsidising ferry links from Scotland to Ireland is counted as purely Scottish spending.

Labour retained the GERS propaganda to use against the SNP, but now this propaganda is backfiring in England ... good. Cameron is welcome to discard the Barnett formula as it will show Scotland it does not need the loudly broadcast supposed subsidy from England."

=====

---

## Re:Scotland:subsidised region of the nation Britain

Posted by Indy Evolution - 2008/09/05 21:01

---

Sample of British Capital/South East Investments • . £30 billion subway upgrade program see - [tinyurl.com/6sxrgv](http://tinyurl.com/6sxrgv) . £5 billion on one London railway station see - [tinyurl.com/6yheht](http://tinyurl.com/6yheht) . £16 billion For another London rail line see - [tinyurl.com/yphdwl](http://tinyurl.com/yphdwl) . £1 billion to upgrade an existing railway station see - [tinyurl.com/5sn8mm](http://tinyurl.com/5sn8mm) . three quarters of a billion on a Dome ! see - [tinyurl.com/6h6ezn](http://tinyurl.com/6h6ezn) . Followed of course by yet another London regeneration project £5 billion see [tinyurl.com/5l3jp3](http://tinyurl.com/5l3jp3) . £6 billion Channel Tunnel Rail Link see - [tinyurl.com/4pg53n](http://tinyurl.com/4pg53n) . £2.5 billion -Roads just around the Docklands in London <http://tinyurl.com/55wh6b> . £3.2 billion For Another Tube line see - [tinyurl.com/5qjoao](http://tinyurl.com/5qjoao) . £1 billion improvement to an existing Light Rail Line see - [tinyurl.com/6q2424](http://tinyurl.com/6q2424) . £20 billion for a Second Thames flood barrier planned see - [tinyurl.com/5uf79a](http://tinyurl.com/5uf79a) . A £4 billion greenhouse tower over Battersea power station see- [tinyurl.com/6ac8hn](http://tinyurl.com/6ac8hn) . £9.3 billion for the Channel Tunnel - see [tinyurl.com/6s4vsb](http://tinyurl.com/6s4vsb) . £4.3 billion for a 5th Heathrow Terminal see - [tinyurl.com/2h5hx6](http://tinyurl.com/2h5hx6) . £5 billion Upgrade other London airport upgrades see - [tinyurl.com/5oe82n](http://tinyurl.com/5oe82n) . £10 billion Plans for Heathrow link to Channel tunnel see - [tinyurl.com/568dzq](http://tinyurl.com/568dzq) . £13 billion for a third runway Heathrow runway see - [tinyurl.com/3bgdtt](http://tinyurl.com/3bgdtt) . £9 billion for Brown's plans to transform Thames Gateway see - [tinyurl.com/4kr3pt](http://tinyurl.com/4kr3pt) . £18 billion London Olympics (including £184 million stolen from the Scottish Lottery) see - [tinyurl.com/olympics](http://tinyurl.com/olympics) cam

=====